

## 1. Mahāyāna Paintings in Bagan (notes by Wai Zin Htun)

Below is my translation of notes kindly made by Wai Zin Htun. These notes are from a paper on Mahayana Painting in Bagan (ပုဂံခေတ် မဟာယာနပန်းချီ) written by Zawgyi in 1993. The paper appears in "Collected Works of Saya Zawgyi, Vol.1" (ဆရာဇော်ရှိ စာပေါင်းချုပ် ပထမတွဲ), pp.15-18. I would like to express my gratitude to Wai Zin Htun for his notes, which enable me to learn the key information of the original text, and which may help the readers of NewPilgrim to learn more about the history of Myanmar.

- In the era of Bagan there were two distinct schools of Buddhism – Theravāda and Mahāyāna. These two schools have arisen after the Buddha attained His last passing away (*Parinibbāna*).

ပုဂံခေတ်မဟာယာနပန်းချီ ဗုဒ္ဓသာသနာတွင်ထေရဝါဒဂိုဏ်းနှင့် မဟာယာနဂိုဏ်း ဟုခွဲခြားပြီးနောက်မှအထင်အရှားဖြစ်လေသည် ထိုဂိုဏ်းနှစ်ဂိုဏ်းသည် မြတ်စွာဘုရားပရိနိဗ္ဗာန် စံတော်မူပြီးအနစ်တရာအတွင်း၌သိသာထင်ရှားခြားနားလာပါသည်

- In the second century (CE), by the great power of the Hinduist kings of India these two schools have ceased in influence. Then in the eleventh century it almost disappeared. In spite of that, the Buddhist teachings prospered ("shone") outside India.

တဖန်နှစ်ရာစုလောက်၌အိန္ဒိယတွင်ဟိန္ဒူဘာသာဝင်မင်းများတန်ခိုးကြီးလာရာထိုဂိုဏ်းနှစ်ခု၏အရှိန်အဝါသည်တစစမှေးမှိန်၍ ဆယ့်တစ်ရာစုတွင်ကွယ်သယောင်ဖြစ်ခဲ့သည် သို့ ရာတွင်ဗုဒ္ဓသာသနာသည် အိန္ဒိယပြင်ပတွင်ထွန်းကားလာလေသည်

- From Southern India, Theravāda descended to Sri Lanka, Myanmar, Thailand, (and) Kambodia, where it is prospering until today. The school of Mahāyāna descended from Pāla(?) (and) Kashmir to Nepal, Tibet, central Asia, China, Korea, (and) Japan, where it is prospering until today. In Myanmar, Theravāda (Buddhism) was immensely prosperous during the era of Shin Arahān. However, the philosophy of Mahāyāna, for the next three hundred years, was there side by side with Theravāda.

ထေရဝါဒသည် အိန္ဒိယတောင်ပိုင်းမှတဆင့်သီဟိုဠ်သို့ လည်းကောင်း မြန်မာနိုင်ငံ ယိုးဒယား ကမ္ဘောဇ သို့ ဆင်းသက်ခဲ့ရာယခုတိုင်ထွန်းကားလျက်ရှိသည် မဟာယာနဂိုဏ်းသည် ပါလတိုင်း ကသ္မီယတိုင်း မှ နီပေါ တိဗက် အာရှအလယ်ပိုင်း တရုတ်ကိုရီးယားဂျပန်သို့ ဆင်းသက်ခဲ့ရာယခုတိုင်ထွန်းကားလျက်ရှိသည် မြန်မာနိုင်ငံတွင် ထေရဝါဒသည်ပုဂံခေတ်အနှော်ရထား ရှင်အရဟံတို့ လက်ထက်တွင်အလွန်ထွန်းကားသည် သို့ ရာတွင် မဟာယနဝါဒသည်လည်းနောင်နှစ်ပေါင်းသုံးရာထိ ထေရဝါဒနှင့်အတူကြိုကြားရှိခဲ့သည်

- according to the ("historical") stone inscriptions and researchers, Mahāyāna has descended into the Sirikhetta (one of the first eras of Myanmar) from the Pāla(?) region, through Nepal and Tibet and was available ("open") together with Theravāda.

သမိုင်းနှင့်ကျောက်စာသုတေသီတို့ ၏အလိုအရ မဟာယာနသည် ပါလတိုင်းမှ နီပေါတိဗက်မှတဆင့် သရေခေတ္တရာသို့ ဆင်းသက်လာ၍ ထေရဝါဒနှင့်အတူပွင်းလန်းခဲ့သည်

- Then again, when the Sirikhetta passed, during the Bagan era – until the era of Anawratha – Mahāyāna competed with Theravāda, without any of them coming to prominence.

တဖန်သရေခေတ္တရာပျက်၍ပုဂံခေတ်အနော်ရထာခေတ်တိုင်အောင်ထေရဝါဒနှင့်သူမသာကိုယ်မသာအပြိုင်ဖြစ်ခဲ့သည်

- During the era of Anawratha, because the king favored Theravāda (over Mahāyāna), Theravāda became the religion of the country and Mahāyāna deteriorated. However, there were still devout followers.

အနော်ရထာခေတ်ရောက်သောအခါ ထေရဝါဒကိုမင်းကချီးမြှောက်သဖြင့် နိုင်ငံတော်သာသနာဖြစ်လာပြီး မဟာယာနသည် အင်အားဆုတ်ယုတ်ကွယ်ပလာသည် သို့သော် ကိုးကွယ်သူအရှိန်အဝါအတန်အသင့်ရှိနေသေးသည်

- Sometimes it seems as if the countrymen of Bagan were not able to distinguish between the two schools and followed (both). It is possible to know that based on the wishful writings of the Theravādins where was the Mahāyānist wish to attain Nibbāna especially after meeting with (the Buddha) Ariyametteyya.

တခါတရံပုဂံပြည်သားတို့ သည်နှစ်ဂိုဏ်းစလုံးကိုမခွဲခြားဘဲကြာကိုးကွယ်ကြဟန်တူသည်

ထေရဝါဒတို့၏ဆုတောင်းစာများတွင်မဟာယာနတို့၏အဓိကထားသောအရိမေတ္တယျကိုဖူးမြော်ခွင့်ကြုံပြီးနိဗ္ဗာန်ကိုမျှော်မှောက်ပြုလိုသောဆန္ဒတို့ပါရှိသည်ကိုထောက်၍သိနိုင်လေသည်

- For example, the prince Rājakumāra offered servants to the pagoda (that he) built, and then proclaimed in a stone inscription: "May this deed of mine be the cause of my attainment of omniscience, (and) if these servants are cruel toward the pagoda, may they be unable to meet with the (future Buddha) Ariyametteyya." The first wish has the specific nature of Theravāda, however the second case, the way of curse, has the nature of Mahāyāna.

ဥပမာရာဇကုမာရမင်းသားသည်ဘုရားတည်ကျွန်လှပြီးသောအခါ ဤဇုအမှုသည်ကား သဗ္ဗညုတဉာဏ်ပညာရအံ့သော အကြောင်းဖြစ်စေသတည်း ဤဘုရားအား ငါလူခွဲသောကျွန်တို့အားနှိပ်စက်လျှင် အရိမေတ္တယျအားမဖူးရပါစေနှင့်ဟု ကျောက်စာ၌ဆိုခဲ့သည် ပထမဆုတောင်းသည်ထေရဝါဒသဘောသက်သက်ဖြစ်သည် ဒုတိယအချက်ကိုနိပုံသည် မဟာယာနအယူသဘောရှိသည်

- Sometimes it seems as if the countrymen of Bagan studied the scriptures of both Theravāda and Mahāyāna until the end of Bagan (era) and the start of the era of Inwa. For example, it is written in a stone that the Thiri-Zeya brother-kings of(?) Taung-Dwin built a monastery in the Bagan's Wut-Kyi-Inn(?) (ဝတ်ကြီးအင်း) and **အလိုဌာတက်န္တကျောင်း** for monks (with) the Buddhist scriptures, astrological, medicinal, and poetry books amounting to 295. Among the scriptures there were (also) Nyāyabindu, Nyāyabinduṭīkā, Hetubindu, (and) Hetubinduṭīkā considered to be (of) Mahāyāna.

တခါတရံပုဂံသားတို့ သည် ထေရဝါဒ မဟာယာနကျမ်းဂန် တို့ ကိုအတူလေ့လာဟန်ရှိသည်မှာ ပုဂံပျက်ပြီး

အင်းဝခေတ်တိုင်အောင်ဖြစ်သည် ဥပမာ ၁၀၄ခုနှစ်တွင်တောင်တွင်းမင်းသီရိဇေယျသူမောင်နံတို့ သည်

ပုဂံဝတ်ကြီးအင်း၌ကျောင်းဆောက်ပြီး ပိဋကတ်ပေဒင်ဆေးအလံကာကျမ်းပေါင်း ၂၉၅ကျမ်းကို

ရဟန်းတို့အလိုဌာတက်န္တကျောင်းကျောက်ရေးထိုးခဲ့သည် ကျမ်းစာများအနက် နျာယဝိနွှု နျာယဝိနွှုဋီကာ ဟေတုဝိနွှု

ဟေတုဝိနွှုဋီကာ တို့ သာ မဟာယာနကျမ်းတို့အဖြစ်ယူဆကြသည်

- Thus, even the paintings of the Bagan era can be an evidence for Mahāyāna, unsurpassed by Theravāda, in the era of Bagan. Although the nature of (these) Mahāyāna paintings is not (portraying) the Buddha-to-

be deity (*bodhisatta* deity) as one who is above the Buddha Himself in respect and veneration, (the Buddha-to-be) has great compassion and loving-kindness, being able to release beings into Nibbāna. Therefore, emphasizing faith and observance, the faculty of faith over the faculty of wisdom, (they) make effort to get free from the Saṃsāra by the way of faith.

ထို့ကြောင့်ပုဂံခေတ်တွင်ထေရဝါဒသာမကမဟာယာနပါကြီးကြားရှိခဲ့သည်ဟုဆိုကြကုန်သော်ပန်းချီများကလဲသက်သေခံနိုင်လေသည် မဟာယာနပန်းချီသဘောမှာ ဗောဓိသတ်နတ်ဘုရားကို ဗုဒ္ဓဘုရားထက် ကြည်ညိုမြင့်မြတ်သည်ဟု မယူသော်လည်း မဟာဂရုဏာမေတ္တာတော်ရှိ၍သတ္တဝါတို့ နိဗ္ဗာန်သို့ကယ်ချွတ်ပို့ နိုင်သည်ဟုယူကြသည် ထို့ကြောင့် သဒ္ဓါကြည်ညိုစောင့်စည်းခြင်း သဒ္ဓါန္တေ ကိုပညိန္တေထက်ပိုအလေးထားကာသဒ္ဓါန္တေနည်းဖြင့် သံသရာမှလွတ်မြောက်အောင် အားထုတ်သည်ဟုဆိုသည်

- in worship, the Buddha-to-be deity is given various names and worshipped.

ကိုးကွယ်ရာတွင် ဗောဓိသတ်နတ် ဘုရားကိုအမည်အမျိုးမျိုးပေးကာကိုးကွယ်ကြသည်

- Sometimes (as) Karunā-Shin Deity of the World (ဂရုဏရှင်လောကနတ်); Mañjūsiri Varajina Garuṇā Shin (မဉ္ဇူသီရိဝရဇိန်ဂရုဏရှင်) complete in satisfaction, grace, and compassion; Padumapāṇi (ပဒုမပါဏီ) who holds the lotus bloom, as the one of diamond in hand (ဝဇီရဏပါဏီ), (thus) getting names in (different) regions.

တခါတရံလောကကိုစောင့်ရှောက်တော်မူသော ဂရုဏရှင်လောကနတ် နှစ်သက်ကျက်သရေဂရုဏာနှင့်ပြည့်စုံသောမဉ္ဇူသီရိ ဝရဇိန်ဂရုဏရှင်အဖြစ် ဝဇီရပါဏီပဒုမ္မာကြာပွင့်ကိုင်သော ပဒုမပါဏီဟု ဒေသလိုက်အမည်ပေးကြသည်

- Once a female Buddha-to-be deity received the name Tārādevīpāññāpāramitā (= "the perfection of wisdom, the star goddess") and then she (and other Buddhas-to-be) were worshipped even more.

တဖန်အမျိုးသမီးဗောဓိသတ်နတ်ဘုရားအဖြစ် တာရာဒေဝီပညာပါရမိတာဟု ပေး၍ ဗောဓိသတ်နတ်ဘုရားများကို ပိုမိုကိုးကွယ်ကြသည်

- sometimes, to make their art (/ "duty") more pleasing, the painters adorn (the pictures of Buddhas-to-be) with *ābhariga*, *sotaribhariga*, *dharmacakka mudra*, *vara mudra*, *vayākhayā mudra*, *jhāna mudra*, *padumāsana*, *lalitāsana*, with the five requisites/adornments of king, etc.

ပန်းချီဆရာတို့ တာဝန်မှာပိုသပ္ပယ်အောင် အဘင်္ဂံ သောတရိဘင်္ဂံ ဓမ္မစကြာမုဒြာ ဝရဒမုဒြာ ဝယာခယာနမုဒြာ ဈာနမုဒြာ ပဒုမာသန လလိတာသန မင်းဧကရာဇ်တန်ဆာငါးပါးစသည်ဖြင့်ရေးဖွဲ့ကြသည်

- It should be said, that picture(s) of Buddha-to-be is very famous in the Mahāyāna world, and (he) becomes the deity-lord who will take care (for beings) until (he) becomes the next Buddha.

မဟာယာနလောကတွင်ဗောဓိသတ်ပုံတော်သည်အထင်အရှားကျော်စော၍ နောင်ဘုရားပွင့်သည်အထိ စောင့်ရှောက်သောနတ်ဘုရားဖြစ်သည်ဟု ဆိုသင့်သည်

- The Loka-Ushaung Lord (လောကဥသျှောင်ဘုရား) has approached the teachings of (Four Noble) Truth(s) which are unbroakable, firm, and it is believed that if a rain is needed, he is able to allow throwing anything, like Sakka, (the king of gods) (? မိုးသကြားအဖြစ် မိုးရွာစေလိုလျှင် ပသကြပြီးရန်သမျှ ပစ်ခွင်းတတ်သည်)

လောကဥဿျောင်ဘုရားသည် မပျက်မစီးခိုင်းမာသောသစ္စာတရားကို ဥပစာတင်ပြီးမိုးသကြားအဖြစ်  
မိုးရွာစေလိုလျှင်ပသကြပြီးရန်သမျှ ပစ်ခွင်းတတ်သည်ဟုယူဆကြသည်

- In the Mahāyāna Buddhas-to-be of the Bagan era, (we may) see that particularly the tender, subtle, cool deities of world (*lokanat*) are worshipped.

ပုဂံခေတ်မဟာယာနဗောဓိသတ်များတွင်နပျိုသိမ်မွေ့အေးချမ်းသောလောကနတ်အများကိုအထူးကိုးကွယ်တွေ့ရှိကြသည်

- Under the picture of a standing world-deity (*lokanat*), on the Chauk Yar Hlar Pagoda's wall, there is a stone inscription (saying) : "May I, who has carved this, also attain the appropriate benefit, may (I) have all of servants, children and grandchildren."

ခြောက်ရားလှဘုရားနံရံတွင် မတ်ရပ်တော်လောကနတ်ပုံအောက်တွင် ဤကားဘုရားလောင်းလောကနတ်တည်း  
ဤထုလုပ်သောငါလည်းသင့်သောအကျိုးရပါလိုသတည်းလုပ်ကျွေးသောသားမြေးကျွန်ခပင်းလည်းရပါစေသတည်းဟု  
ကမ္မည်းရေးထိုးထားသည်

- Since the sixth century (CE), the Apay Yatana Pagoda (အပါယ်ရတနာဘုရား) is worshipped (as) the star of Buddha-to-be, (and) with the qualities of Buddha-to-be, as a kind of **powerful star (သတ္တိတာရာ)**.

အပါယ်ရတနာဘုရားသည် ဗောဓိသတ်တာရာဗောဓိသတ်ဂုဏ် သတ္တိတာရာအမျိုးအစားအဖြစ် ခြောက်ရာစုမှစ၍  
ကိုးကွယ်ကြသည်

- Avalokiteshvara was worshipped as a Buddha-to-be who sees the suffering of beings, and when (his) tears fall down, a star is born, and thus the multitude of beings are appeased, and may (be seen) with a *paduma* lotus or a brown lotus.

အပလောကီတေသွာသည်သတ္တဝါတို့ ဆင်းရဲဒုက္ခကိုမြင်၍ မျက်ရည်ကျရာမှ တာရာဖွားမြင်လာပြီး  
သတ္တဝါအပေါင်းကိုနှစ်သိမ့်စေနိုင်သောဗောဓိသတ်ဟုကိုးကွယ်ပြီး ပဒုမ္မာကြာကြာညှိစသည်ဖြင့်ပါတတ်သည်

- The quality of Padumapāṇi (Buddha-to-be)'s ability to conjure a lotus; the quality Manjushri's showing lotus – the teachings of the ("Noble") Buddha, the quality of Tārā's showing the purity of lotus, are shown.

ပဒုမပါကိုကြာသည်ဖန်ဆင်းတတ်သောဂုဏ် မဇ္ဈိသီရိကြာသည်မြတ်ဘုရား၏ တရားတော်ကို ပြသောဂုဏ် တာရာ၏  
ကြာသည်စင်ကြယ်ခြင်းကိုပြသောဂုဏ်ကိုပြသည်

- in a statue the Paduma lotus is shown on the left side, and the brown lotus is shown on the right side. (It) has the form of keeping a leg on the lotus throne, and the other (leg) down (touching ground). (Then) **if the leaning waist is small (ယိမ်းနွဲ့သောကိုယ်ခါးသေးရင်)**, and (the Buddha-to-be) has a joyful, clear face, it is worth of bowing down, for the (followers) of Mahāyāna.

ရုပ်ပွားတော်တွင် ဝဲဘက်ပဒုမ္မာကြာယာဘက်တွင်ကြာညှိကိုပြသည် ကြာပလ္လင်ပေါ်တွင် ခြေတဖက်တင် တဖက်ချ  
ထိုင်ဟန်ရှိသည် ယိမ်းနွဲ့သောကိုယ်ခါးသေးရင် ချိရွှင်ပြီးကြည်လင်သောမျက်နှာရှိ၍ မဟာယာနဝါဒတို့  
ဦးညွှတ်ဖွယ်ရာဖြစ်ပါသည်

## 2. About Yan Kin Taung in Brief (ရန်ကင်းတောင်တော် အကျဉ်းချုပ်)

(NOTES MADE BY DAVY WEE FROM FACEBOOK)

- တည်နေရာ - မန္တလေးမြို့ရိုး ဦးထိပ်တံတားမှ အရှေ့ဘက် ၄မိုင်အကွာ

Location – the distance of four miles from eastern (side of) the moat of the Mandalay town-wall

- ပုသိမ်ကြီးမြို့နယ်အလယ်တွင်ရှိ ပင်လယ်ရေမျက်နှာပြင်အထက် အမြင့်ပေ ၈၈၃ပေ တောင်မြောက်အလျား ၆၆၀၆ပေ၊ ရှေ့နောက် ၁၂၅၀ပေ၊ ပကတိ မြေပြင်မှ အမြင့် ၇၀ပေ

The center (of the site) in the Patheingyi Township (in Mandalay Division) is 883 feet above the sea level; length from south to north 6606 feet, 70 feet high from the ground on the site

- အမည်နှစ်မျိုးခေါ်တွင် ရန်ကင်းတောင် - ဘုရားလောင်း ငါးမင်းဘဝ ကံဇာတာညှိုးမိုန်ချိန်တွင် တံငါသည်လက်သို့သက်ဆင်းသေပြီအထင်နှင့် ဓားနှင့်မွန်းကာ ဆားလူးပြီး မြေပြင်မှာ အခြောက်လှမ်းထားစဉ် ခုန်ချထွက်ပြေးကာ ယခုတောင်တော်နေရာအရောက် ဘေးရန်ကင်းစင်သောကြောင့်လည်းကောင်း

Of the two names (of the site), Yan Kin Taung (is derived from the story when) the Buddha-to-be, when he was a king of fish, in the time when his *kamma* of life was weak, it came into hands of a fisherman and when (the fisherman) thought it's dead, he (the fisherman) rolled it in salt and put on the surface of ground to dry. The Buddha-to-be (at that moment) jumped and ran away. Thus the place of the great hill is now (known) as free from danger and enemies. (Yan = enemies, Kin = free from, Taung = hill => "the hill free from enemies")

- ငါးရံမင်းတောင် - အနော်ရထာမင်းကြီး၏ မြေးတော်အလောင်းစည်သူမင်း၏ သားတော်အကြီးဆုံး မင်းရှင်စောအား အမျက်တော်ရှူ၍ ဗိုလ်ပါတစ်သိန်းနှင့်တကွ နောက်လိုက်တို့အား ဤထွန်တုံးပူတက်အရပ် သတ္တရာဇ် ၅၁၃ ခုနှစ်တွင် မြို့တည်စံမြန်းစေလေသည်။ တရံရောအခါ ဤအရပ်တွင် မိုးခေါင်ရေရှား သုံးနှစ်တိုင်တိုင်ဖြစ်သောကြောင့် သံဃာတော်များ၏ မိန့်ကြားမှုအရ ငါးရံမင်းရုပ်တုထုလုပ်ပူဇော်ပြီး ငါးရံမင်းပရိတ်တော်ကို သစ္စာမိဋ္ဌာန်ဖြင့် ရွတ်ဖတ်ကြရာ မိုးမစဲသောကြောင့် သီးနှံပင်များ ပျက်စီးလာသောကြောင့် ရွတ်ဆိုမှုရပ်ပြီး ငါးရံမင်းရုပ်တုအား တောင်တော်ပေါ်သို့ ပင့်ဆောင်ပူဇော်သောကြောင့် ငါးရံမင်းတောင်ဟုလည်းခေါ်တွင်ပါသည်။

Ngar Yant Min Taung – the eldest royal son (prince) of the king Alaung Si Thu, the grandson of the great king Anawratha, saw the (king) Min Shin Saw with anger, and followed (the king Min Shin Saw) with (an army of) hundred thousand (headed by) general(s), who, in this area of Htun-Tone Pu-Tet ["log for harrow-teeth (and) rising heat"] built (here) a town and stayed there. Once upon a time, because there was drought for three years with scarce rain, the monks ordered to make a statue of the king of banded snakeheads [a species of fish] and worship it, upon which (those monks) chanted the protective chanting on banded snakeheads with the reading of "resolution of truth" [i.e. making miracle through the statement that if something is truth than something else should happen]. At that (moment), because the crop was destroyed by uninterrupted rain [i.e. the monks' strategy was not only successful, it was in fact extreme on the other side – to remedy the drought, they in fact caused an excessive downpour], (the monks) stopped their chanting and respectfully moved the statue of banded snakehead upon the hill, paying respects to it, because of which (this site) is also called Ngar Yant Min Taung (Ngar Yant = banded snakehead (fish), Min = king, Taung = hill, => "The Hill of the King of Banded Snakeheads").



- တောင်တော်အား ရသေ့ကြီးဦးခန္တီဦးဆောင်၍ ၁၂၇၅ခုနှစ်မှစတင်ကာ စောင်းတန်း ၁၀၀ ဘုံခုနစ်ဆင့်ပြဿာဒ်တို့အပြင် ကျောက်လှေကားထစ် ၅၈၀ တို့အားလည်းကောင်း။ ဘုရားလောင်းနုစဉ်ဘဝဖြစ်စဉ်များကို ပူဇော်ကာ ကြိုးကြားဘုရား၊ ဟင်္သာဘုရား၊ ဇိနမာရ်အောင် ခိုမင်းဘုရားတို့ကိုလည်း တည်ဆောက်ပူဇော်ခဲ့ပါသည်။

Starting in 1275 (1913 CE), led by the great rishi U Khanti, (the people), apart from building 100 pagoda-corridor-paths, buildings with seven-levels tiered roofs, also built a staircase of 580 stairs, and making offerings (they built also) the Crane Pagoda, Brahmini Duck Pagoda, Jina-Mar Aung Kho Min Pagoda ( = Pagoda (representing) the Pigeon-King that Conquered Māra (the tempter)) (which all represent) the Buddha-to-be in his tender age. [This probably means lives of the Buddha-to-be long before his birth as the prince Siddhartha.]

- သဘာဝကျောက်လိုက်ဂူများမှာ တွင်းညီနောင်လိုက်ဂူ၊ အောင်ဗုဒ္ဓ ခေါ် ဇိုးဝဂူ၊ နတ်သိကြားဂူ ခေါ် နဂါးဂူ (မန္တလေးတောင်မှ မြွေကြီး ဥကောင်အား လွှတ်သောဂူ)၊ ငါးရံမင်းလိုက်ဂူ၊ ဝက်ဘာဂူ၊ ဂူသစ်ဂူ၊ ဖားဂူ၊ ဓမ္မရက္ခိတဂူ။

The natural rock-caves (in the site) are – Twin Nyi Naung Cave, Aung Bodha called Phoe War Cave, Nat Thikya Cave called Nāga Cave (a cave dedicated for three great snakes of Mandalay Hill), Ngar Yar Minn Cave, Wingabar Cave, The New Cave [Gu Thit Gu], Frog Cave [Phar Gu], (and) Dhammarakkhita Cave.

- ပရိယတ္တိ စာသင်တိုက်များ - ဥယျာဉ်ပရိယတ္တိစာသင်တိုက်၊ ရေငုံပရိယတ္တိစာသင်တိုက်၊ ချမ်းမြရံသီပရိယတ္တိစာသင်တိုက်၊ ဝေရီဇယံ သီလရှင်စာသင်တိုက်။

The education (*pariyatti*) centers there are – Uyin Pariyatti Sathin Taik, Ye Ngone Pariyatti Sathin Taik, Chan-Mya-Ranthi Pariyatti Sathin Taik, Werizay Thilashin Sathin Taik (nunnery).

- ပဋိပတ္တိစာသင်တိုက်များ - ဆားတောင်ပဋိပတ္တိစာသင်တိုက်၊ ရန်ကင်းအေးငြိမ်းပဋိပတ္တိစာသင်တိုက်၊ ပတ္တမြားရိပ်သာပဋိပတ္တိစာသင်တိုက်။

The meditation (*paṭipatti*) education centers are – Has-Taung Paṭipatti Sathin Taik, Yan Kin Aye-Ngyeing Paṭipatti Sathin Taik, (and) Pattamya Yeikthar Paṭipatti Sathin Taik.

### 3. About Phol Win Taung in Brief - ဖိုလ်ဝင်တောင်တော် အကျဉ်းချုပ်

(NOTES MADE BY DAVY WEE FROM FACEBOOK)

- တည်နေရာ - စစ်ကိုင်းတိုင်း ယင်းမာပင်မြို့နယ် မင်းဇူးကျေးရွာ

Location – Sakaing Division, Yin Ma Pin Township, Minn Zu Village

- လမ်းညွှန်ချက် ၁ - မုံရွာမှချင်းတွင်းမြစ်ခေါ် သလ္လာဝတီမြစ်ကို ဇက် သို့မဟုတ် စက်လှေများဖြင့် ကူးကာ ညောင်ပင်ကြီးဆိပ်ကိုရောက်သော် ကားငါး၍ ၁၅မိုင်ခန့်ကို တစ်နာရီစီးရုံဖြင့်၎င်း

Directions 1 – Crossing the river Sallavatī<sup>1</sup>, thus named the (portion of) Chin Dwin River in Mon-Ywa, by boat, (you) come to the harbor Nyaung Pin Gyi. There (you) take a taxi for a 15 miles ride, which will take ca. 1 hour.

- လမ်းညွှန်ချက် ၂ - ချင်းတွင်းဖြစ်ကူးတံတားပေါ်မှဖြတ်ကာ ၁၈မိုင် ခရီးကို၎င်း သွားရောက်ဖူးမျှော်နိုင်ပါသည်။

Directions 2 – Crossing the bridge over Chin Dwin River, one can go 18 miles trip and visit (the site).

- ရွှေလသာ ဝါဝါဝင်း - တောင်တော်ပေါ်တွင် ဘုရားပုထိုးစေတီ စုစုပေါင်း (၄၄၆၄၄၄)ဆူရှိကြောင်း။

According to Shwe Lathar Wawawinn, there are altogether 446 444 pagodas.

- သမိုင်းနောက်ခံ - မြတ်စွာဘုရားပွင့်တော်မမူမှီ နှစ်ပေါင်း ၃၀၀ ကတည်းကတည်တံ့လာသော တကောင်းပြည်ပျက်ပြီး ပုဂံပြည်သထုံပြည်အကြား ဧရာဝတီနှင့် သလ္လာဝတီမြစ်ဆုံရာမှစပြီး အထက်အရပ်သည် စစ်မက်ဖြစ်ပွားမှု နယ်မြေသာဖြစ်၍ အုပ်ချုပ်မှုမရောက်နိုင်သောအခါ တောကြောင်(ဓားပြတို့) ထကြွသောင်းကျန်းသောကြောင့် ပြည်သူမှူးမတ်တို့ တိုင်ပင်ပြီး ဗန္ဓုအမည်ရှိအကျင့်ကောင်းသူကို မင်းတင်အုပ်ချုပ်စေပါတယ်။ ပုဂံပြည်ရှင် အနော်ရထာရဲစိတ်ကြားချက်အရ ပုဂံပြည်ကြီးအား သွားရောက်လည်ပတ်ပြီး ဘုရားစေတီပုထိုးတို့တင့်တယ်နေသည်ကို အားကျတော်မူသောကြောင့် အမတ်ကြီး ပညာဗလကို မြေရှာရဖွေခိုင်းရာ ဤတောင်တော်ကိုတွေ့ရှိပြီး မင်းကြီးအိမ်မက်တော်အတိုင်း မြတ်စွာဘုရား ဖလသမာပတ် ဝင်စားသည်ကိုအစွဲပြု၍ ဖိုလ်ဝင်တောင်ဟု ခေါ်တွင်စေပါသည်။

The historical background – Between the fall of Tagaung Country, which was built 300 years before the (Siddhartha Gotama) attained Buddhahood and the (period of) Bagan and Thaton Countries, since the time when the Sallavatī River and Ayeyarwaddy River met, the upper region became a land of genuine origin. Later, when it couldn't come under the rule (of a king), the robbers (/ "jungle cats", "knife showers") arose and were rioting, because of which the countrymen and ministers discussed. Then it (was decided that) Bandhava, a person of good manners, will be made a king and rule. According to the invitation of the lord of Bagan Country, Anawratha, (king Anawratha) travelled to and inside the great Bagan Country, and admiring the grace of the pagodas (there), he (the king Anawratha) asked the minister Paññābala to find a (plot of) land. (The minister) found this great hill, where according to the dream of the great king (Anawratha), the Buddha entered the attainment of *Phalasamāpatti*,<sup>2</sup> and based on it (this site) is called Pho-Win-Daung.

- တောင်တော်ပေါ်ရှိ ဆုတောင်းပြည့်ဘုရားများမှာ - ဆုတောင်းပြည့်ဘုရား၊ တောင်းတိုင်းပြည့် ဘုရား၊ တတိုင်းပြည့်ဘုရား၊ တင်းတင်းပြည့်ဘုရား၊ သက်တော်ရဘုရား၊ သက်တော်ရှည်ဘုရား တို့ဖြစ်ပါတယ်။

The pagodas of fulfilled wishes that are on the great hill, are – Pagoda of Fulfilled Wishes [Hsu Taung Pyi Pagoda], The Hill Column Fulfilling Pagoda [Taung Taing Pyi Pagoda], Rampart Fulfilling Pagoda [Tadaing Pyi Paboda], Standing Firm Fulfilling Pagoda [Tinn Tinn Pyi Pagoda], Pagoda of Gaining Respectable Life [Thet-Taw-Yar Pagoda], and Pagoda of Long Respectable Life [Thet-Taw-Shay Pagoda].

<sup>1</sup> Note here that Sallavatī river is **not** Salween (သံလွင်) of Shan State. Sallavatī is a portion of Chin-Dwin River, in Sagaing Division.

<sup>2</sup> *Phalasamāpatti* is the purest form of Nibbāna attainment, void of perception and feeling. It is attained only by Arahants and Buddhas who can enter all the eight *jhānas*, because the eight *jhāna* forms the medium, through which this *Phalasamāpatti* attainment is entered.

## 4. No More Mystery? – The Primordial Form of *Tipiṭaka* Revealed

Although there are many theories regarding the historicity of the Pāli scriptures, the Pāli Commentaries (in their final version usually dated to 6<sup>th</sup> century CE) themselves mention what were the parts that were added during the Buddhist Councils. Because of the fact, that the Pāli Commentaries themselves clarify which were the parts added later, it would be a "lie" on the part of the commentators if they knew that something was added and didn't mention it in their Commentaries. It is possible to assume that those assumed additions appeared naturally with recitation and oral tradition, and that the commentators maybe didn't know that certain texts were added. This would be however a squared assumption (assumption x assumption, assumption<sup>2</sup>), and as such it should not be taken seriously. The most important case here is with *Abhidhamma*, which is in fact a cubed assumption (assumption x assumption x assumption<sup>3</sup>), because the assumption of it's being added by oral tradition, multiplied by the assumption that the Commentators didn't know about this "addition", is further multiplied by the assumption that monks themselves would be able to compose such a masterpiece. Thus the idea that Abhidhamma was not taught by the Buddha Himself is a three-dimensional assumption, i.e. a very unreliable conclusion.

Below I am giving all the references to the additions in the main Pāli Tipiṭaka as they are glossed in the Pāli Commentaries.

### 1) Last verses of *Dīgha Nikāya - Mahāparinibbāna Sutta* :

- a. *Ayaṃ tathāgataṃ pacchimā vācāti idaṃ pana saṅgītikāraṇaṃ vacanaṃ.* (= "This is the last speech of the Tathāgata" - this is however what the (Buddhist) Council compilers said.)
- b. *So ca bhagavato pacchimo sakkhisāvako ahoṣīti saṅgītikāraṇaṃ vacanaṃ.* (= "He was then the last witness (/enlightened person)" is what the Council compilers said.)
- c. *Evamevaṃ bhūtapubbanti evaṃ etaṃ atīte dhātunidhānampi jambudīpatale bhūtapubbanti. Tatiyaṃ saṅgītikāraṇaṃ imaṃ padaṃ tthapayimsu.* (= "This was what happened in the past" – such was this origin in essence, in the past, what happened in the past at the plato of India (/ "The Island of Rose-Apple"). Indeed, this utterance was added by those of the Third (Buddhist) Council.
- d. *Aṭṭhaddoṇaṃ cakkhumato sarīrantiādīgāthāyo pana tambapaṇṇidīpe therehi vuttāti.* (= The verses such as "Aṭṭhaddoṇaṃ cakkhumato sarīraṃ" were however told by the elders of Sri Lanka (/ "The Island of Tambapaṇṇi") (i.e. during the Third Buddhist Council).

### 2) *Majjhima Nikāya – 3. Suññatavaggo – 4. Bākula Sutta (whole) - Idaṃ pana suttaṃ dutiyasaṅgahe saṅgītanti.* (= This discourse was however rehearsed (for the first time) at the second compilation (i.e. during the Second Buddhist Council (?)).<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup> This discourse contains certain wonderful qualities of ven. Bākula, and how he passed away. Ven. Bākula is believed to be ordained when he was eighty (80) years old, and passed away to Nibbāna when he was hundred and sixty (160) years old. The Buddha Himself stayed in the world as the Buddha for 45 years only, and thus it is clear that the information about ven. Bākula's final passing away to Nibbāna were first known after the Buddha passed away, as well as after the First Buddhist Council. The Pāli Commentaries recognize it and explain that the Bākula Sutta was added during the "second compilation". Second Buddhist Council



- 3) Suttanipāṭa – 2. Cūḷavaggo – 11. Rāhula Sutta : *Tato param "itthaṃ sudaṃ bhagavā"tiādi saṅgītikārakānaṃ vacanaṃ.* (= From then onward, "in this way the Blessed One" and so on, is what the Council compiler said (i.e. during the First Buddhist Council).
- 4) Suttanipāṭa – 2. Cūḷavaggo – 14. Dhammika Sutta : *Pacchimaḍḍhuṃ pana saṅgītikārahehi vuttantipi āhu.* (= It is said that the last half was however told by the compilers of the (First) Council.)
- 5) Suttanipāṭa – 3. Mahāvaggo – 2. Padhāna Sutta : *Tenāha bhagavā – 452. "Tassa sokaparetassa, vīṇā kacchā abhassatha; Tato so dummano yakkho, tatthevantaradhāyathā"ti. Saṅgītikārakā āhaṃsūti eke, amhākaṃ panetaṃ nakkhamatīti.* (= Some say, that "The lute fell from the armpit of the one ruined by grief. Then that sad ogre (Māra) disappeared right there." was told by the compilers of the (First) Council, however by us this should not be ignored.)
- 6) Suttanipāṭa – 3. Mahāvaggo – 3. Subhāsita Sutta
  - a. *Idamavoca bhagavāti idaṃ subhāsitalakkhaṇaṃ bhagavā avoca. Idaṃ vatvāna sugato, athāparaṃ etadavoca satthāti idaṃ lakkhaṇaṃ vatvā atha aññampi etaṃ avoca satthā. Idāni vattabbagāthaṃ dassetvā sabbametaṃ saṅgītikārakā āhaṃsu.* ("Thus spoke the Exalted One" – the Exalted One said that this is the characteristic well explained (*subhāsita*). "This was said by the Sugata (/the Buddha who Went Well)", and thus spoke the Teacher afterwards" – after (the Buddha) spoke about this characteristic, the Teacher then spoke this another (thing). The compilers of the (First) Council told all this after they showed (/told) the verse that should be told.)
  - b. *So yaṃ pasannākāraṃ akāsi, yañca vacanaṃ bhagavā abhāsi, taṃ dassentā saṅgītikārakā "atha kho āyasmā"tiādimāhaṃsu.* (= Thus the compilers of the (First) Council showed whatever the Exalted One did to arouse faith, and whatever (He) said, and then said "and then the venerable" etc.)
- 7) Suttanipāṭa – 3. Mahāvaggo – 4. Sundarikabhāradvāja Sutta (/ Pūraḷāsa Sutta) : *Tattha evaṃ me sutantiādi saṅgītikārakānaṃ vacanaṃ.* (= There "thus have I heard" is what the compilers from the (First) Council said.)
- 8) Petavatthu – 2. Ubbarivaggo - 8. Cūlasetṭhipetavatthu : *Tato parā saṅgītikārahehi vuttā – 250. ... 256. ... manussadevā"ti.* (Thereafter (comes) what the compilers of the Council said – "250. ... 256. ... people and deities." (i.e. all of the seven verses were added by the council-editors.)
- 9) Petavatthu – 2. Ubbarivaggo - 10. Uttaramātupetivatthu : *331. "Divāvihāragataṃ bhikkhuṃ, gaṇḍātīre nisinnakaṃ; Taṃ peti upasaṅkamma, dubbaṇṇā bhīrudassanā. 332. "Kesā cassā atidīghā, yāvabhūmāvalambare; Kesehi sā paṭicchannā, samaṇaṃ etadabravī"ti. – Imā dve gāthā saṅgītikārahehi idha ādito ṭhapitā.* (= These two verses were added by the compilers of the (First) council from here onwards: 331. "The monk who enjoys the day, sitting on the bank of a river, him a female-ghost approached, of bad color, of frightening when seen. 332. Even her hair was

---

was held to purify Vinaya, not to decide about scriptures or Dhamma. It is therefore more probable that "second compilation" in fact means the Third Buddhist Council. This is one of several cases where we have a text in the original Pāli Tipiṭaka, although it was first known years after the Buddha passed away. It is also noteworthy, that the Commentaries sincerely reveal its true origin.

extremely long, touching even the ground; by hair she (was) covered, (and) to that ascetic she told that.")

- 10) *Therīgāthāpāli – 1. Ekakanipāto* : *Pabbajitvā ca sīlācārasampannā satthuno ca tesaṃ therānañca santike ovādaṃ labhivā ghaṭentiyo vāyamantiyo nacirasseva arahattaṃ sacchākaṃsu. Tāhi udānādivasena tattha tattha bhāsītā gāthā pacchā saṅgītikārahehi ekajjhaṃ katvā ekakanipātādivasena saṅgītiṃ āropayimṃsu "imā therīgāthā nāmā"ti.* (= After ordination, also (because they) were endowed with morality and (good) conduct, (they) then obtained the admonishment near the Teacher and their Elders. They strived and tried and before long they attained the (attainment of) Arahatta. The verses told by them in the way of exclamation etc. here and there were later unified by the compilers of the (First) Council and arranged in a rehearsal of "Chapter One" and so on, (saying) "This are the Verses of Therīs".)
- 11) *Buddhavaṃsa – 1. Ratanacarīkamanakaṇḍaṃ*
- a. *Taṃ pana bhagavato karuṇupattim dassentehi saṅgītikāle saṅgītikārahehi – 2.* "Sampannavijjācaraṇassa tādino, jutindharassantimadehadhārino; *Tathāgatassappaṭipuggalassa, uppajji kāruṇṇatā sabbasatte"ti. – Ayaṃ gāthā ṭhapitā.* (= This verse, however, was established by the compilers of the (First) Council during the time of the (First) Council, (who) showed the arising of compassion in the Exalted One – "There arose the compassion for all beings in the Tathāgata, the person without peer, the one endowed with knowledge and (good) manners, bearer of light, bearer of the last body (before *Parinibbāna*)."
- b. *Tena vuttaṃ saṅgītikārahehi bhagavato parivitakkadassanatthaṃ – 3. "Na hete jānanti sadevamānusa, buddho ayaṃ kīdisako naruttamo; Iddhibalaṃ paññābalañca kīdisaṃ, buddhabalaṃ lokahitassa kīdisaṃ. 4. "Na hete jānanti sadevamānusa, buddho ayaṃ edisako naruttamo; Iddhibalaṃ paññābalañca edisaṃ, buddhabalaṃ lokahitassa edisaṃ. 5. "Handāhaṃ dassayissāmi, buddhabalamanuttaraṃ; Caṇkamaṃ māpayissāmi, nabhe ratanamaṇḍita"nti.* (Thus was it said by the compilers of the (First) Council, in order to show the consideration of the Exalted One – 3. "Indeed, the people and gods do not know how is the Buddha such a best man; what are (his) psychic powers and the power of wisdom, what are the Buddha powers of the compassionate to the world. 4. "Indeed, the people and gods do not know that the Buddha is such a best man, that (his) psychic powers and the power of wisdom is such, that such are the Buddha powers of the compassionate to the world. 5. "What if I shal show the peerless power of Buddha; create the walking path, in the sky, adorned by jewels.")
- c. *Tamatthaṃ pakāsentehi saṅgītikārahehi – 6. "Bhumma mahārājikā tāvatiṃsā, yāmā ca devā tusitā ca nimmitā; Paranimmitā yepi ca brahmakāyikā, ānanditā vipulamakaṃsu ghosa"nti. – Ādigāthāyo ṭhapitāti veditabbā.* (It should be known, that 6. "The (deities) of earth, of the (Four) Great Kings (Heaven), of the (Heaven of) Thirty-Three, Yamas as well as the gods from Tusita and Nimmita (Heavens; (those) of Paranimmita (Heaven) as well as those of Brahma Body, (so) happy they made a great noise." and so on (were) the verses added by the compilers of the (First) Council who explained the meaning.

- d. *50-1. Idāni dhammasenāpatissa pavattiṃ dassentehi saṅgītikārahehi "khiṇāsavehi vimalehi"tiādigāthāyo vuttā* (= Now the verses such as "by those of destroyed defilements (and) void of impurities" were told by the compilers of (the First) Council who showed the situation of the General of Dhamma [i.e. ven. Sāriputta].)
- e. *Idāni therena puṭṭhassa bhagavato byākaraṇaṃ dassentehi saṅgītikārahehi – 78. "Tassa puṭṭho viyākāsi, karavīkamadhuragiṃ; Nibbāpayanto hadayaṃ, hāsayanto sadevakaṃ. 79. "Atītabuddhānaṃ jinānaṃ desitaṃ, nikīlitaṃ buddhaparamparāgataṃ; Pubbenivāsānugatāya buddhiyā, pakāsayi lokahitaṃ sadevake"ti. – vuttam;* (= Now the compilers of the (First) Council, who showed the utterance of the Exalted One, questioned by the Elder, (added) – 78. "Asked by him, the one of (the bird) *karavīka*'s sweet voice, cooling (another's) heart, cheering up the (world) with deities. 79. "Taught by the Conquerors of the past, traditional, descending by the lineage of the Buddhas; By (His) wisdom, following the previous lives, (the Buddha) explained (the issue) for the joy of the world with (its) deities.)
- 12) *Buddhavaṃsa – 28. Buddhapakiṇṇakakathā : "Aparimeyyito kappe, caturo āsum vināyakā"tiādikā aṭṭhārasagāthā saṅgītikārahehi ṭhapitā nigamanagāthāti veditabbā.* (= It should be known that the eighteen verses starting as "In the innumerable aeon, there were four overlords (/Buddhas)" were added as the introductory verses, by the compilers of the (First) Council.)
- 13) *Jātakas namely [77] 7. Mahāsupinajātaka : Parinibbute pana bhagavati saṅgītikārakā "usabhā"tiādīni tīṇi padāni aṭṭhakathaṃ āropetvā "lābūni"tiādīni cattāri padāni ekaṃ gāthaṃ katvā ekakanipāṭapālīṃ āropesunti.* (= However, when the Exalted One has passed away (/attained *Parinibbāna*), the compilers of the (First) Council arranged the three lines starting with "*usabhā*" as commentary, made the four lines starting with "*lābūni*" into a single verse, and (thus) arranged the Pāli (text) as the Chapter One.)
- 14) *Nettipakaraṇa – 3. Niddesavāro - Hārasaṅkhepo : Iccāyasmā ajitoti saṅgītikārakavacanāṃ.* ("Thus the venerable Ajita" is what the compilers of the (First) Council said.)

The case of *Kathāvatthu*, the seventh book of Abhidhamma Piṭaka (traditionally published as fifth of the seven) as authored by ven. Moggaliputtatissa during the Third Buddhist Council is explained in detail in *Dhammasaṅgaṇī-Aṭṭhakathā - Nidānakathā*.

<i>Dhammasaṅgaṇī-Aṭṭhakathā in Pāli language<sup>4</sup></i>	Translation in English by Pe Maung Tin <sup>5</sup>
<i>Pakaraṇaparicchedato panesa dhammasaṅgaṇīvibhaṅgadhātukathāpuggalapaññatti ikathāvatthuyamakapaṭṭhānānaṃ sattannaṃ pakaraṇānaṃ vasena ṭhito. Ayamettha ācariyānaṃ samānakathā.</i>	There is a consensus of opinion among teachers that the Abhidhamma is divided into seven books, viz., <i>Dhammasaṅgaṇī</i> , <i>Vibhaṅga</i> , <i>Dhātukathā</i> , <i>Puggalapaññatti</i> , <i>Kathāvatthu</i> , <i>Yamaka</i> , and <i>Paṭṭhāna</i> .

<sup>4</sup> *Dhammasaṅgaṇī-Aṭṭhakathā – Nidānakathā*

<sup>5</sup> "The Expositor (Atthasālinī) – Buddhaghosa's Commentary on the Dhammasaṅgaṇī, The First Book of the Abhidhamma Piṭaka", Pe Maung Tin, PTS, London, 1976; pp.5-8. (I have omitted footnotes to avoid copyright issues and to encourage you, the reader, to obtain the original book. I have also made minor corrections whenever suitable.)

<i>Vitaṇḍavādī panāha – 'kathāvatthu kasmā gahitaṃ? Nanu sammāsambuddhassa parinibbānato aṭṭhārasavassādhikāni dve vassasatāni atikkamivā moggaliputtatissattherenetaṃ ṭhapitaṃ? Tasmā sāvakabhāsitaṭṭha chaḍḍetha na'nti.</i>	But the Vitaṇḍa {of Abhayagiri (according to <i>Maṇidīpa</i> )} school say: 'Why bring in <i>Kathāvatthu</i> ? Was it not settled by Tissa, Moggali's son, two hundred and eighteen years after the Buddha's Parinibbāna? Hence it is [merely] the word of his disciples. Reject it.'
<i>'Kiṃ pana chappakaraṇāni abhidhammo'ti?</i>	[To whom we say: ] 'Are there then only six books in the Abhidhamma?'
<i>'Evaṃ na vadāmi'ti.</i>	'I do not say so.'
<i>'Atha kiṃ vadesi'ti.</i>	'What do you say then?'
<i>'Sattappakaraṇāni'ti.</i>	'Seven books.'
<i>'Kataraṃ gahetvā satta karosi'ti?</i>	'How do you get the seven?'
<i>'Mahādharmamahadayaṃ nāma atthi, etena saha sattā'ti.</i>	'There is a book called <i>Mahādharmamahadaya</i> (in the Great Commentary); with that I make the seven.'
<i>'Mahādharmamahadaye apubbaṃ natthi, katipayāva pañhāvārā avasesā, kathāvatthunāva saddhiṃ sattā'ti.</i>	'In the <i>Mahādharmamahadaya</i> there is nothing which has not been said already in the <i>Dhammahadaya Vibhāṅga</i> {in <i>Vibhāṅga Pāḷi</i> }. And the remaining catechetical section, which is peculiar to your <i>Mahādharmamahadaya</i> , is not long enough to make up a treatise by itself. Hence it makes the seven only with the <i>Kathāvatthu</i> .'
<i>'No kathāvatthunā, mahādhātukathā nāma atthi, tāya saddhiṃ sattā'ti.</i>	'Nay, not with the <i>Kathāvatthu</i> . There is the <i>Mahā-Dhātukathā</i> ; with that I make the seven.'
<i>'Mahādhātukathāyaṃ apubbaṃ natthi, appamattikāva tanti avasesā. Kathāvatthunāva saddhiṃ sattā'ti.</i>	'But there is nothing new in that either. The remaining texts, peculiar to it, are not long enough to make up a treatise. Hence the <i>Kathāvatthu</i> makes the seventh.'

<i>Sammāsambuddho hi sattappakaraṇāni desento kathāvatthuṃ patvā yā esā puggalavāre tāva catūsu pañhesu dvinnāṃ pañcakānaṃ vasena aṭṭhamukhā vādayutti taṃ ādiṃ katvā sabbakathāmaggesu asampunṇabhāṇavāramattāya pāḷiyā mātikaṃ ṭhapesi.</i>	When the Supreme Buddha, who taught us the seven treatises, came to the <i>Kathāvatthu</i> , he began with an eight-faced inquiry into the theory of the person (or soul), in four questions each of the fivefold divisions and laid down a table of contents in a text not quite as long as one recital, to be adopted in all the discourses:
<i>Sā panesā "puggalo upalabbhati saccikaṭṭhaparamatthenāti. Āmantā.</i>	'Is the person known in the sense of a real and ultimate fact? Yes.
<i>Yo saccikaṭṭho paramattho tato so puggalo upalabbhati saccikaṭṭhaparamatthenāti. Nahevaṃ vattabbe. Ājānāhi niggahaṃ...pe...</i>	Is the person known in the same way as a real and ultimate fact is known? Nay, that cannot be. Acknowledge your refutation.

<i>puggalo nupalabbhati saccikaṭṭhaparamatthenāti. Āmantā. Yo saccikaṭṭho paramattho tato so puggalo nupalabbhati saccikaṭṭhaparamatthenāti. Nahevaṃ vattabbe. Ājānāhi niggahaṃ...pe....</i>	Is the person not known in the sense of a real and ultimate fact? {Yes.} <sup>6</sup> Is the person unknown in the same way as any real and ultimate fact is known? Nay, it cannot be. Acknowledge your refutation.
<i>Sabbattha puggalo upalabbhati sabbattha puggalo nupalabbhati, sabbadā puggalo upalabbhati sabbadā puggalo nupalabbhati, sabbesu puggalo upalabbhati sabbesu puggalo nupalabbhati saccikaṭṭhaparamatthenā"ti (kathā. 15-16)</i>	Is the person known <i>everywhere</i> in the sense of a real and ultimate fact? Or is it unknown? Is it known <i>always</i> in the sense of a real and ultimate fact? Or is it unknown? Is it known <i>in everything</i> in that sense, or is it unknown?"
<i>evaṃ paṭhamam vādam nissāya paṭhamam niggahaṃ, dutiyam nissāya dutiyam ...pe... aṭṭhamam nissāya aṭṭhamam niggahaṃ dassentena satthārā ṭhapitā.</i>	Thus, showing the eight aspects and their respective refutations, the table of contents {/"it indeed"} has been laid down by the Teacher.
<i>Iminā nayena sabbattha mātikaṭṭhapanaṃ vedītabbhaṃ.</i>	{It should be known that declaring of all matrices (was done) in this way.} <sup>7</sup>
<i>Tam panetaṃ mātikaṃ ṭhapento imaṃ disvā ṭhapesi – mama parinibbānato aṭṭhārasavassādhikānaṃ dvinnam vassasatānaṃ matthake moggaliputtatissatthero nāma bhikkhu bhikkhusahassamajjhe nisinno sakavāde pañca suttasatāni paravāde pañcāti suttasahassaṃ samodhānetvā dīghanikāyappamāṇaṃ kathāvatthupakaraṇaṃ bhājessatīti.</i>	Now when he laid down the table of contents he foresaw that, two hundred and eighteen years after his death, Tissa, Moggalī's son, seated in the midst of one thousand bhikkhus, would elaborate the <i>Kathāvatthu</i> to the extent of the <i>Dīgha Nikāya</i> , bringing together five hundred orthodox and five hundred heterodox Suttas.

<i>Moggaliputtatissattheropi idaṃ pakaraṇaṃ desento na attano ñāṇena desesi, satthārā pana dinnanayena ṭhapitamātikāya desesi.</i>	So Tissa, Moggalī's son, expounded the book not by his own knowledge but according to the table of contents laid down, as well as by the method given, by the Teacher.
<i>Iti satthārā dinnanayena ṭhapitamātikāya desitattā sakalampetaṃ pakaraṇaṃ buddhabhāsītameva nāma jātāṃ.</i>	Hence the entire book became the word of the Buddha.
<i>Yathā kiṃ? Yathā madhupiṇḍikasuttantādīni.</i>	After which precedent? After the <i>Madhupiṇḍika-suttanta</i> and others.
<i>Madhupiṇḍikasuttantasmiñhi bhagavā "yatoniḍānaṃ bhikkhu purisaṃ papañcasaññāsārikhā samudācaranti, ettha ce natthi abhinanditabbam abhivaditabbam ajjhositabbam, esevento</i>	In that Suttanta the Blessed one, after laying down heads of a discourse, ended thus: 'Bhikkhu, owing to such causes the factors of prolonged rebirth beset a man. Here if there be nothing to be pleased withal, proud of, or assimilated, then it is

<sup>6</sup> Contrary to the original Pāli, the English translation I have here contains "Nay, it is not known."

<sup>7</sup> I didn't find this portion translated in the published translation.



<i>rāgānusayāna”nti (ma. ni. 1.202) mātikaṃ ṭhapetvā uṭṭhāyāsana vihāraṃ pāvisi.</i>	the end of the latent bias of lust,' etc.—and then rose from his seat and entered the monastery.
--	--

<i>Dhammappaṭiggāhakā bhikkhū mahākaccānattheraṃ upasaṅkamitvā dasabalena ṭhapitamātikāya atthaṃ pucchiṃsu.</i>	The bhikkhus, who received the doctrine, approached Mahākaccāna and questioned him as to the meaning of the heads laid down by the Buddha of the Ten Powers.
<i>Thero pucchitamattakeneva akathetvā dasabalassa apacitidassanatthaṃ "seyyathāpi āvuso puriso sārattiko sārāgavesi”ti (ma. ni. 1.203) sāropamaṃ āharitvā</i>	The Elder, not replying direct to the question, said by way of paying homage to the Buddha: 'Sirs, a person desirous of and seeking pith should bear in mind this simile of pith
<i>sārarukkho viya bhagavā sākhāpalāśasadiṣā sāvakā, "so hāvuso bhagavā jānaṃ jānāti, passaṃ passaṃti cakkhubhūto ñāṇabhūto dhammabhūto brahmabhūto vattā pavattā atthassa ninnetā amatassa dātā dhammassāmī tathāgato”ti</i>	– the Buddha is like the pith of a tree, his disciples are like the branches and leaves. For, Sirs, the Buddha, who knows all knowable things, discerns all discernible things, is the eye of the world, the wisdom of the world, is like the constituents of wisdom to the world, is like the Ariyan Path to the world, is the speaker and originator of the Four Truths, the expounder of their meaning, the giver of the Deathless, the master of the Law, the Tathāgata.'
<i>satthāraṃ thometvā punappunaṃ therehi yācito satthārā ṭhapitamātikāya atthaṃ vibhajitvā "ākaṅkhamānā ca pana tumhe āyasmanto bhagavantameva upasaṅkamitvā etamatthaṃ paṭipuccheyyātha</i>	After thus praising the Teacher he, at the repeated request of the bhikkhus, expounded in great detail the meaning of the heads of discourse laid down by the Buddha and <b>sent them away saying</b> : 'Sirs, if you are willing, approach the Buddha and ask him the meaning.
<i>sace sabbaññūtaññāṇena saddhiṃ saṃsandiyaṃānaṃ sameti gaṇheyyātha, no ce mā gaṇhitthā”ti iminā adhippāyena "yathā vo bhagavā byākaroti tathā naṃ dhāreyyāthā”ti <b>vatvā uyyojesi.</b></i>	And you should accept what he explains to you, so that if my explanation harmonizes with omniscience you should take it; if not, reject it.' {With this meaning, "how the Teacher tells you, thus remember it."} <sup>6</sup>

<i>Te satthāraṃ upasaṅkamitvā pucchiṃsu.</i>	They approached the Buddha and asked him.
<i>Satthā dukkathitaṃ kaccānenāti avatvā suvaṇṇālīṅgaṃ ussāpento viya gīvaṃ unnāmetvā supupphitasatapattasassirikaṃ mahāmukhaṃ pūrento brahmassaraṃ nicchāretvā sādhu sādhu therassa sādhuṅkāraṃ datvā</i>	The Teacher, without referring to any (possibly) ill-spoken words of Kaccāna, raised his neck aloft like a golden drum and filling with breath his noble mouth, graceful as the full-blown lotus, emitted the Brahmā voice, and saying, 'Well done, well done!' to the Elder, added:
<i>"paṇḍito, bhikkhave, mahākaccāno, mahāpaṇḍito bhikkhave mahākaccāno,</i>	'Bhikkhus, learned is Mahākaccāna, profoundly wise is Mahākaccāna.

<i>maṃ cepi tumhe, bhikkhave, etamatthaṃ paṭipuccheyyātha, ahampi taṃ evamevaṃ byākareyyaṃ yathā taṃ mahākaccānena byākata”nti (ma. ni. 1.205) āha.</i>	If you had asked me the same question, I would have answered exactly as he has done {/"exactly as Mahākaccāna has answered"}.'
---	--

<i>Evaṃ satthārā anumoditakālato paṭṭhāya ca pana sakalaṃ suttaṃ buddhabhāsitaṃ nāma jātaṃ.</i>	Thus since the time when the Teacher gave his approval, the whole Suttanta became the word of the Buddha.
<i>Ānandattherādīhi vitthāritasuttesupi eseva nayo.</i>	And it is the same with the Suttas expounded by Ānanda and others.
<i>Evameva sammāsambuddho sattappakaraṇāni desento kathāvatthuṃ patvā vuttanayena mātikaṃ ṭhapesi. Ṭhapento ca pana imaṃ addasa –</i>	Thus in teaching the seven books, when he came to the Kathāvatthu the Buddha laid down the table of contents in the way mentioned above. In doing so he foresaw that

<i>Mama parinibbānato aṭṭhārasavassādhikānaṃ dvinnaṃ vassasatānaṃ matthake moggaliputtatissatthero nāma bhikkhu bhikkhusahassamajjhe nisinno</i>	Two hundred and eighteen years after his death, Tissa, Moggalī's son, seated in the midst of one thousand bhikkhus,
<i>sakavāde pañca suttasatāni paravāde pañcāti suttasahassaṃ samodhānetvā dīghanikāyappamāṇaṃ kathāvatthuppakaraṇaṃ bhājessatīti.</i>	would elaborate the <i>Kathāvatthu</i> as is stated above.

<i>Moggaliputtatissattheropi imaṃ pakaraṇaṃ desento na attano ñāṇena desesi, satthārā pana dinnanayena ṭhapitamātikāya desesi.</i>	And Tissa, Moggalī's son, expounded the book not by his own knowledge but according to the table of contents laid down, as well as by the method given, by the Teacher.
<i>Iti satthārā dinnanayena ṭhapitamātikāya desitattā sakalampetaṃ pakaraṇaṃ buddhabhāsīameva jātaṃ.</i>	Hence {"because (it) was expounded by the method given by the Teacher"} the entire book became the word of the Buddha.
<i>Evaṃ kathāvatthunāva saddhiṃ satta pakaraṇāni abhidhammo nāma.</i>	Thus the Abhidhamma consists of seven books inclusive of the <i>Kathāvatthu</i> .

Apart from *Kathāvatthu*, the Buddha predicted and approved yet another scripture – *Milindapañhā* (*Milindapañhapāḷi*). The difference is, that unlike for *Kathāvatthu*, where the Buddha Himself laid down the table of contents, for *Milindapañhā* the Buddha didn't give any directives, no table of contents, no structure, no resolutions. The mysterious contradiction denying Buddha's *vipāka* (*kamma* repercussions)

against the eleven cases of Buddha suffering of His previous *kamma* described in the *Apadāna Pāḷi*, have been mentioned by me in the previous NewPilgrim.

<i>Milindapañha Pāḷi</i> <sup>8</sup>	Translation in English by I.B. Horner <sup>9</sup>
<i>Atīte kira kassapassa bhagavato sāsane vattamāne garigāya samīpe ekasmiṃ āvāse mahābhikkhusaṅgho paṭivasati,</i>	It is said that in the past when Kassapa was the Lord and was promulgating the Dispensation, a large Order of monks was living in a residence near the Ganges.
<i>tattha vattasīlasampannā bhikkhū pātova utthāya yaṭṭhisammajjaniyo [yaṭṭhisammuñjaniyo (sī. pī.)] ādāya buddhaguṇe āvajjentā aṅgaṇaṃ sammajjitvā kacavarabyūhaṃ karonti.</i>	The monks there were possessed of habitual morality. Rising early and taking a long-handled broom and sweeping the courtyard while reflecting on the special qualities of the Buddha, they would make the rubbish into a heap.
<i>Atheko bhikkhu ekaṃ sāmaṇeraṃ "ehi sāmaṇera, imaṃ kacavaraṃ chaḍḍehi"ti āha, so asuṇanto viya gacchati, so dutiyampi...pe... tatiyampi āmantiyamāno asuṇanto viya gacchateva.</i>	Then a monk spoke to a novice, saying: "Come, novice, through out this rubbish." But he went away as though not hearing. Summoned a second and a third time, he still went away as though not hearing.
<i>Tato so bhikkhu "dubbaco vatāyaṃ sāmaṇero"ti kuddho sammajjanidaṇḍena pahāraṃ adāsī.</i>	Then that monk was angry, and thinking: "This novice is difficult to speak to" he gave him a blow with the handle of the broom;
<i>Tato so rodanto bhayena kacavaraṃ chaḍḍento "iminā kacavarachaḍḍanapuññakammena yāvāhaṃ nibbānaṃ pāpuṇāmi [na pāpuṇāmi (syā.)], etthantare nibbattanibbattaṭṭhāne majjhanhikasūriyo [suriyo (sī. pī.)] viya mahesakkho mahātejo bhavēyya"nti paṭhamaṃ patthanaṃ paṭṭhapesi.</i>	And he, crying and throwing out the rubbish through fear, made the first aspiration: "Through this meritorious deed of throwing out the rubbish may I, wherever I am successively reborn until I attain nibbāna, be of tgreat might and great glory like the mid-day sun."
<i>Kacavaraṃ chaḍḍetvā nahānatthāya garigātittamaṃ gato garigāya ūmivegaṃ gaggarāyamānaṃ disvā</i>	After he had thrown out the rubbish he went to a ford of the Ganges to wash, and on seeing the swirling surge of the waves of the Ganges
<i>"yāvāhaṃ nibbānaṃ pāpuṇāmi [na pāpuṇāmi (syā.)], etthantare nibbattanibbattaṭṭhāne ayaṃ ūmivego viya ṭhānuppattikapaṭibhāno bhavēyyaṃ akkhayapaṭibhāno"ti dutiyampi patthanaṃ paṭṭhapesi.</i>	he made the seond aspiration: "May I, wherever I am successively reborn until I attain nibbāna, be prompt in saying the right thing and prompt in answering questions (carrying all before me) like this surge of waves."

<sup>8</sup> *Milindapañhapāḷi – 1. Bāhirakathā - Pubbayogādi*

<sup>9</sup> "Milinda's Questions", Volume 1, I.B. Horner, Luzac & Compandy, LTD., London, 1969; pp.3-5. (I have omitted the footnotes to avoid copyright issues and to encourage you, the reader, to obtain the original book.)

<i>Sopi bhikkhu sammajjanisālāya sammajjanim ṭhapetvā nahānatthāya gaṇḍatittham gacchanto sāmaṇerassa patthanam sutvā "esa mayā payojitopi tāva evaṃ pattheti, mayham kiṃ na samijjhissati"ti cintetvā</i>	And when that monk had put away the broom in the place for brooms, he went to the ford of the Ganges to wash, and hearing the novice's aspiration he thought: "While he who was merely instigated by me aspires thus, in what may I not be successful?"
<i>"yāvāham nibbānam pāpuṇāmi [na pāpuṇāmi (syā.)], etthantare nibbattanibbattaṭṭhāne ayaṃ gaṇḍāūmivego viya akkhayapaṭibhāno bhaveyyam,</i>	And he made the aspiration: "May I, wherever I am successively reborn until I attain nibbāna, be prompt in answering questions (carrying all before me) like this surge of the waves of the Ganges;
<i>iminā pucchitapucchitam sabbam pañhapāṭibhānam vijaṇetum nibbeṭhetum samattho bhaveyya"nti patthanam paṭṭhapesi.</i>	And may I be able to unravel promptly and explain all the answers to the questions constantly asked me by this (novice.)"

<i>Te ubhopi debesu ca manussesu ca saṃsarantā ekaṃ buddhantaram khepesum.</i>	Both of these spent the whole interval between (the uprising of) one Buddha and the next circling-on among devas and men.
<i>Atha amhākaṃ bhagavatāpi yathā moggaliputtatissatthero dissati, evametepi dissanti</i>	And even as Moggali's son, the Elder Tissa was seen by our Lord, even so were these also seen,
<i>mama parinibbānato pañcavassasate atikkante ete upparijjissanti, yaṃ mayā sukhumam katvā desitam dhammavinayaṃ, taṃ ete pañhapucchanaopammayuttivasena nijjaṭam niggumbam katvā vibhajissantīti niddiṭṭhā.</i>	as it is explained: "Five hundred years after I have attained complete nibbāna these will arise (again) and, disentangling it and making it clear by asking questions and by the use of similes, they will explain what was made abstruse by me when I taught Dhamma and Discipline."

The novice was later born as a human and became the king Milinda, and the monk was born at that time also as a human, and later became the Arahant Nāgasena. King Milinda then approached the Arahant Nāgasena several times, and asked various questions regarding Dhamma and Vinaya. At the conclusion of the book *Milindapañhapāḷi* we may find an implication that the king became a Stream-Enterer (losing doubt regarding the Buddha, Dhamma, and Saṅgha), and further is written that the king became a monk, and as a monk he became an Arahant.

I think there are three reasons why the book *Milindapañhapāḷi* was included in the collection of the original *Tipiṭaka* – 1. The Commentaries quote from *Milindapañhapāḷi*, as if it was an authoritative scripture. 2. The Buddha Himself predicted and approved of the questions and answers contained in *Milindapañhapāḷi*. 3. The answers given by ven. Nāgasena led the listener to dispelling of doubts, perhaps Stream-Entry, and ultimately, although indirectly, toward Arahant-hood.

May all beings be happy ☺

monk Sarana